

Editorial Manager(tm) for Water, Air, & Soil Pollution
Manuscript Draft

Manuscript Number:

Title: The Effectiveness and Feasibility of using Ochre as a Soil Amendment to Sequester Dissolved Reactive Phosphorus in Runoff

Article Type: Full research paper

Keywords: phosphorus, adsorption, ochre, water quality, metal, acid mine drainage, soil,

Corresponding Author: Owen Fenton, PhD

Corresponding Author's Institution: Teagasc

First Author: Owen Fenton, PhD

Order of Authors: Owen Fenton, PhD; Laura Kirwan, PhD; Daire Ó hUallacháin, PhD; Mark Gerard Healy, PhD

Abstract: Incidental losses of dissolved reactive phosphorus (DRP) to a surface waterbody originate from direct losses during land application of fertilizer, or where a rainfall event occurs immediately thereafter. Another source is the soil. One way of immobilising DRP in runoff before discharge to a surface waterbody, is to amend soil within the edge of field area with a high phosphorus (P) sequestration material. One such amendment is iron ochre, a by-product of acid mine drainage. Batch experiments utilising two grassland soils at two depths (topsoil and sub-soil), six ochre amendment rates (0, 0.15, 1.5, 7.5, 15 and 30 g kg⁻¹ mass per dry weight (dwt) of soil) and five P concentrations (0, 5, 10, 20 and 40 mg L⁻¹) were carried out. A proportional equation, which incorporated P sources and losses, was developed and used to form a statistical model. Back calculation identified optimal rates of ochre amendment to soil to ameliorate a specific DRP concentration in runoff. Ochre amendment of soils (with no further P inputs) was effective at decreasing DRP concentrations to acceptable levels. A rate of 30 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil was needed to decrease DRP concentrations to acceptable levels for P inputs of ≤ 10 mg L⁻¹, which represents the vast majority of cases in grassland runoff experiments. However, although very quick and sustained metal release above environmental limits occurred, which makes it unfeasible for use as a soil amendment to control P release to a waterbody, the methodology developed within this paper may be used to test the effectiveness and feasibility of other amendments.

1 **The Effectiveness and Feasibility of using Ochre as a Soil**
2 **Amendment to Sequester Dissolved Reactive Phosphorus in**
3 **Runoff**

4

5 Owen Fenton^{a*}, Laura Kirwan^b, Daire Ó hUallacháin^a, MarkGerard Healy^c

6 ^aTeagasc, Environmental Research Centre, Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford, Ireland

7 ^bWaterford Institute of Technology, Co. Waterford, Ireland

8 ^c Civil Engineering, National University of Ireland Galway, Co. Galway, Ireland.

9

10 * *Corresponding author:* Teagasc, Environmental Research Centre, Johnstown Castle,
11 Wexford, Ireland. Tel: +353 53 9171271 Email: owen.fenton@teagasc.ie

12

13 **Abstract**

14 Incidental losses of dissolved reactive phosphorus (DRP) to a surface waterbody
15 originate from direct losses during land application of fertilizer, or where a rainfall
16 event occurs immediately thereafter. Another source is the soil. One way of
17 immobilising DRP in runoff before discharge to a surface waterbody, is to amend soil
18 within the edge of field area with a high phosphorus (P) sequestration material. One
19 such amendment is iron ochre, a by-product of acid mine drainage. Batch experiments
20 utilising two grassland soils at two depths (topsoil and sub-soil), six ochre amendment
21 rates (0, 0.15, 1.5, 7.5, 15 and 30 g kg⁻¹ mass per dry weight (dwt) of soil) and five P
22 concentrations (0, 5, 10, 20 and 40 mg L⁻¹) were carried out. A proportional equation,
23 which incorporated P sources and losses, was developed and used to form a statistical
24 model. Back calculation identified optimal rates of ochre amendment to soil to
25 ameliorate a specific DRP concentration in runoff. Ochre amendment of soils (with no
26 further P inputs) was effective at decreasing DRP concentrations to acceptable levels.
27 A rate of 30 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil was needed to decrease DRP concentrations to
28 acceptable levels for P inputs of ≤ 10 mg L⁻¹, which represents the vast majority of
29 cases in grassland runoff experiments. However, although very quick and sustained
30 metal release above environmental limits occurred, which makes it unfeasible for use
31 as a soil amendment to control P release to a waterbody, the methodology developed
32 within this paper may be used to test the effectiveness and feasibility of other
33 amendments.

34

35 **Keywords:** phosphorus, adsorption, ochre, water quality

36

37

38 **1 Introduction**

39

40 Incidental losses of dissolved reactive phosphorus (DRP) in runoff on dairy farms
41 following a rainfall event originate from two sources: organic and inorganic fertilizer
42 inputs to grow grass and P from the soil (Preedy et al. 2001). One way of
43 immobilising this P before discharge to a surface waterbody, is to amend soil in a
44 riparian zone with a material that has a high P sequestration capacity. Iron-rich
45 materials have been used to sequester P from wastewater (Gallimore et al. 1999; Elliot
46 et al. 2002; Rhoton and Bigham, 2005; Johansson-Westholm, 2006; Brennan et al.
47 2011; Fenton et al. 2011). The capacity of ochre to sequester P from agricultural and
48 municipal wastewater has previously been investigated for ochre from coal mining
49 areas of the U.K. (Bozika, 2001; Heal et al. 2005; Dobbie et al. 2009), the U.S (Sibrell
50 et al. 2009) and metal mining areas of south east Ireland (Fenton et al. 2007). In
51 saturation experiments using low concentrations of inorganic P, Fenton et al. (2007)
52 found that the maximum P retention capacity was approximately 19 g P kg^{-1} , for metal
53 mining ochre sourced from an abandoned copper sulphur mine in the Avoca–
54 Avonmore catchment. In addition, kinetic experiments showed that P removal by
55 Avoca ochre to be very rapid. For example, the supernatant ortho-P ($\text{PO}_4\text{-P}$)
56 concentration decreased by 97% (Fenton et al. 2009a) within 5 minutes of shaking an
57 ochre/P-enriched mixture. However, the maximum P retention capacity for coal
58 mining iron ochre is site-specific: 26 g P kg^{-1} in Polkemmet, Central Scotland, and
59 30.5 g P kg^{-1} , in Minto, Central Scotland (Heal et al. 2004). A long-term field study
60 utilising coal mining ochre in pellet and granular forms was successful in reducing
61 total phosphorus (TP) concentrations without metal mobilisation (Dobbie et al. 2009).

62

63 Although the P adsorption capacity of Avoca ochre in the Fenton et al. (2009a) study
64 was comparable with ochre tested in the U.K., its characteristics were site-specific.
65 Fenton et al. (2009a) showed that Avoca ochre was fine-grained and had low particle
66 density (2.3 g mL^{-1}), which facilitated entrainment and transportation in runoff during
67 flooding events. The study found that the high P adsorption capacity was due to high
68 iron (Fe) mineralogy. Iron minerals such as goethite, jarosite, hydronium jarosite,
69 lepidocrocite, and ferrihydrite, were found in the Avoca ochre, and P readily adsorbed
70 to their surfaces (Fenton et al. 2007). As the acid mine drainage (AMD) exited the
71 underground workings, oxidisation occurred, leading to ochre precipitation. This
72 resulted in higher concentrations of calcium (Ca), Cu, potassium (K), magnesium
73 (Mg), sodium (Na) and zinc (Zn) in the ochre than in the tributary water. Some
74 elements in the AMD ochre were as a result of background geology, while others
75 were directly related to the mining on site. Stereomicroscopy of this ochre identified
76 oolites and diatoms, which were indicative of an AMD environment (Fenton et al.
77 2009b).

78

79 Best management practices (BMPs) 'at source' (e.g. on the farmyard) aim to reduce
80 the amount of P lost in runoff and drainage waters. A common BMP is a riparian
81 buffer, or vegetative buffer strip, which limits P movement pathways from the field to
82 a waterbody (Sharpley et al. 2006). These vegetative buffer, or filter, strips are
83 effective in particulate phosphorus (PP) removal and have removal rates of between
84 45% (by concentration) (Schmitt et al. 1999) and 90% (by concentration) (Abu-Zreig
85 et al. 2003), but have limited removal capacity in relation to dissolved reactive
86 phosphorus (DRP) (Sharpley et al. 2006; Dorioz et al. 2006).

87

88 Application of P-immobilizing materials (alum, water treatment residuals (WTR), fly
89 ash, gypsum) to such vegetative buffer (or filter strips) through amendment of edge-
90 of-stream soils, is one possible means of reducing soluble P losses to aquatic systems
91 (Penn et al. 2007; Wagner et al. 2008; Brennan et al. 2011; Fenton et al. 2011). In
92 Ireland, soils receiving inorganic fertilizers as part of the Nitrates Directive (SI 610 of
93 2010) must maintain vegetative buffer zones at a minimum of 1.5 m in width from
94 river bank edge. For organic manures, this width is generally 5 m, but for narrow,
95 small parcels (< 1 ha) of land, it is 3 m. For steep slopes > 10%, it is 5 m, and for
96 Karst areas or water abstraction points, larger buffer distances of 250 m must be
97 maintained. In the current Agri-Environmental Options Scheme, a 1.5 m fenced buffer
98 must be established to prevent bovine access to the water course. Other agri-
99 environment schemes across Europe have similar stipulations (EC 2005).

100

101 The present study examines P sequestration and metal losses from ochre amended
102 soils. The ochre was derived from AMD along a ditch running from the Deep Adit
103 site northeast of Whitebridge to the River Avoca (60 m downstream) (Fig 1).

104 Specifically, the objectives of this paper are:

105 1) to determine the optimal rate of ochre, or similar P sorbing amendments to soil,
106 to produce a given DRP concentration in runoff, to minimise losses to a surface
107 water body.

108 2) to determine if Avoca ochre, when mixed with soil, may be used as a safe soil
109 amendment to sequester P.

110

111 **2 Materials and Methods**

112

113 2.1 Ochre and soil collection and analysis

114

115 Ochre from Whitebridge, Avoca, Co. Wicklow, south east Ireland (latitude 52° 48'N,
116 longitude 6° 12'W, mean precipitation 1200 mm and temperature 9.6 °C) was
117 collected, oven dried, sieved to < 2mm, and physically characterised in a previous
118 study (Fenton et al. 2009a).

119

120 The P adsorption study was conducted using two permanent grassland soils taken
121 from Johnstown Castle Research Centre (latitude 52° 12' N, longitude 6° 30'W, mean
122 annual precipitation 1002 mm and temperature 9.6 °C). Each soil was sampled at two
123 depths:

- 124 • Soil A (classified as a humic cambisol after the World Reference Base
125 (WRB); Depth 1, top-soil (0 - 10 cm – standard Irish agronomic sampling
126 depth); Depth 2, sub-soil (11 - 30 cm)
- 127 • Soil B (WRB classification- gleyic cambisol); Depth 1, top-soil (0 - 10 cm);
128 Depth 2, sub-soil (11 - 30 cm)

129

130 Incorporation of ochre at depth may be important where a perched watertable interacts
131 with buffer zones and contributes to runoff, or where DRP in runoff is leached to
132 groundwater.

133

134 2.2 Physical characterisation of the soil and ochre

135

136 Samples from both sites and depths were air dried, then sieved to < 2mm, wet sieved
137 into coarse sand (0.5 -2 mm), fine sand (0.053 - 0.5 mm), and silt/clay (<0.053 mm)

138 fractions, and then oven dried and weighed. Particle size distribution (PSD) of the silt
139 clay fraction was carried out using the pipette method (BSI 1989; BS 1796).

140

141 2.3 pH, lime requirement, C/N ratio and background nutrient and metal status of soil
142 and ochre

143

144 Soil from both sites and depths, ochre samples, and ochre-amended soils from both
145 sites and depths used in batch experiments, were first analysed for pH in water using
146 an automated Gilson 215 liquid handler dip system (Middleton, Wisconsin, USA)
147 (n=4). The soil-to-distilled water ratio was 1:2, and samples were allowed to settle for
148 no more than 5 minutes before analysis. For quality control, a laboratory soil of
149 known pH and nutrient status was used. The control had the following characteristics
150 and no significant difference was found when analysed with the samples from the
151 present study: pH - 5.89; Mg - 205 mg kg⁻¹; K - 72 mg kg⁻¹; and P - 5.3 mg kg⁻¹.

152

153 The lime requirement (LR) of all soils (i.e. the lime required to adjust soil to a pH of
154 6.3) was determined after Pratt and Blair (1963). In this procedure, 10 ml of soil per
155 volume was added to 20 ml of Shoemaker-McLean-Pratt (SMP) buffer (pH 7.5),
156 shaken for 30 min on a G10 gyratory shaker (New Brunswick Scientific, Edison, New
157 Jersey, USA), and poured through a No. 2 Whatman filter (0.2 µm) before analysis on
158 a flow-Gilson 215 liquid handler. Total organic carbon (TOC) and nitrogen (N) of the
159 soils was determined by placing 0.25 g of soil and standard samples in a porcelain
160 combustion boat on a CN2000 analyser (Leco Corporation, U.S.A).

161

162 In Ireland, the soil test phosphorus (STP) is classified using Morgan's extraction
163 solution. An index varying from 1 to 4 is applied, depending on the STP of a soil.
164 STP Index 1 represents a mineral soil with a P range of 0 to 3 mg L⁻¹, whereas a STP
165 Index 2 represents a P range of 3 to 5 mg L⁻¹. Index 3 represents a range of 3 to 8 mg
166 L⁻¹ and Index 4 is >8 mg L⁻¹. Soil A (Depth 1) had a STP of 5.5 mg L⁻¹ and Depth 2
167 had a STP of 2.6 mg L⁻¹. Soil B (Depth 1) had a STP of 2.8 mg L⁻¹ and Depth 2 had a
168 STP of 2.7 mg L⁻¹ (Table 1). This low STP minimised native P desorption during the
169 experiments. Optimum growing conditions for grassland is STP Index 3 with a soil P
170 range of 3 to 8 mg L⁻¹ for mineral soils. Soil test phosphorus was measured as
171 Morgan's phosphorus (P_m; mg L⁻¹) and converted to Mehlich 3 phosphorus (M3P; mg
172 kg⁻¹) for indicative purposes, using the following equation (Tunney et al. 1998):

173

$$174 \quad M3P = 8.52 * P_m^{0.85} \quad [1]$$

175

176 Oven dried soil samples, with a grain size < 2mm (6 replicates for each soil type),
177 were analysed for STP, Mg and K as follows: 3 mL of soil by volume was added to 15
178 mL of Morgan's extracting solution in a round-bottomed flask and shaken on a G10
179 gyratory shaker for 30 min. The suspension was then filtered through a No. 2
180 Whatman filter into disposable test tubes and analysed colorimetrically using the
181 chemical reaction between P and ammonium molybdate.

182

183 To investigate metal mobilisation and the suitability of metal mining ochre to
184 sequester P from runoff, the supernatant water from all batch experiments was
185 analysed for trace metals (cadmium (Cd), chromium (Cr), Cu, iron (Fe), manganese

186 (Mn), nickel (Ni), lead (Pb) and Zn) using an ICP-MS. Metal release from ochre-
187 amended soil over time was carried out in a kinetic test at 1, 5, 10, 15, 30, 60 min.

188

189 2.4 Batch experiment with soil and ochre amendment

190

191 To achieve a homogenous < 2 mm mix, the soils were saturated with distilled water,
192 manually mixed into a slurry, and left to air dry for 60 d. After this time, ochre was
193 mixed to soil aliquots in the following proportions: 0 (the study control), 0.15, 1.5,
194 7.5, 15 and 30 g ochre kg⁻¹ mass per dry weight (dwt) of soil. Such amendment rates
195 were also used for ferrihydrite (Fe₃HO₈·4H₂O) amendments to soils for P
196 sequestration (Rhoton and Bigham 2005).

197

198 The ochre amendment was applied during continuous mixing of the soil with a spray
199 of distilled water to allow greater incorporation of the ochre into the soil. Next, the
200 soil and ochre mix was air dried, and the bulk dry samples were crushed, rolled and
201 sieved to < 2 mm. All batch experiment protocols were carried out after Cucarella and
202 Renman (2009). For each soil and depth, in each 100-ml- capacity container, 2.5 g of
203 oven dried-ochre-and-soil mixture (mixed in the ratios described above) and air dried
204 soil-only was overlain with 50 ml of synthetic P solution (potassium phosphate
205 (KH₂PO₄) with concentrations of 0, 5, 10, 20, or 40 mg P L⁻¹ (n=2). Although end-
206 over-end shakers do not simulate overland flow, for consistency with other studies,
207 the samples were sealed and then mixed in an end-over-end shaker for 24 hr, after
208 which the samples were vortexed for 2 min, centrifuged at 100 rpm for 10 min,
209 filtered and analysed for DRP in a nutrient analyser (Konelab, Ontario, USA).

210

211 2.5 Data analysis

212

213 A proportional equation, which incorporated P sources (P inputs) and losses (DRP
214 losses in runoff and STP), was developed. Back calculation identified optimal rates of
215 ochre amendment to soil to ameliorate a particular DRP concentration in runoff.

216

217 In the batch experiment, ochre with negligible background P content was added to a
218 soil of known STP. This content was based on historic records of inorganic and
219 organic fertilizer application. P_{Lost} (%) was calculated as:

220

$$221 \quad P_{\text{Lost}} (\%) = \frac{P_{\text{Runoff}}}{P_{\text{Input}} + \text{STP}} * 100 \quad [2]$$

222

223 The proportion of P not adsorbed by the amendment after P equilibrium (P_{Lost} ; %) depends on the P in runoff (P_{Runoff} ; mg L^{-1}) that has not been adsorbed to the ochre; 224 the Morgan's STP of the soil before any ochre amendment (STP; mg L^{-1}); and the P 225 added in the batch experiments or as a fertilizer (P_{Input} ; mg L^{-1}). A high P_{Lost} (%) 226 signifies a greater amount of P in solution available to be lost to a waterbody and a 227 low P_{Lost} signifies more P has been adsorbed by the ochre. Statistical analysis was 228 conducted in SAS v 9.1, using a generalised linear mixed model (GLMM) with a logit 229 link and a normal distribution: 230

231

$$232 \quad x\beta = \ln\left(\frac{P_{\text{Lost}}}{1 - P_{\text{Lost}}}\right) \quad [3]$$

233

234 where $1-P_{\text{Lost}}$ is P adsorbed onto ochre. The effects of ochre additions, P_{Input} , soil type,
235 and soil depth (topsoil or subsoil), and their interactions were tested in the model
236 using Type III tests of fixed effects. The background pH of the soils before
237 amendments was variable. To compare results, pH needed to be accounted for in the
238 statistical analysis. The soil variation was accounted for by including pH, determined
239 in a SMP buffer, as a random effect.

240

241 After initial analysis was complete, back-calculation within the model made it
242 possible to predict P_{Runoff} . This then allowed calculation of the amount of ochre
243 amendment needed per kg of soil to reduce P_{Runoff} to acceptable levels.

244

245 **3. Results & Discussion**

246

247 3.1 Physical characterisation of soil

248

249 The PSD of both soils are presented in Table 1. Soil A (Depth 1) contained a higher
250 sand fraction and lower silt and clay fractions than Depth 2. There was a slight
251 textural change with depth, but it remained within the sandy-loam textural class. Soil
252 B (Depth 1 and 2) had similar coarse and fine sand fractions, but differed with respect
253 to their silt and clay fractions. Both soil depths also had a sandy-loam textural class.
254 Both soils were well-drained in the field and it was easy to amend the soils with
255 ochre.

256

257 Physical characterisation of the ochre used in this study was carried out by Fenton et
258 al. (2009a). The ochre was fine-grained with the following constituency: coarse sand,

259 21.6% by mass; fine sand, 19.5% by mass; silt, 22.3% by mass; and clay, 30.9% by
260 mass.

261

262 3.2 STP, pH and C/N ratio

263

264 The study sites had similar topography and low to very low STP (Table 1). Such STP
265 concentrations are deemed environmentally sound and thereby minimised native P
266 desorption during the experiments. The average pH of all soils and soil depths was
267 6.5 ± 0.6 , which is the optimal pH for grass growth. With little ochre amendment, pH
268 remained at, or above, this optimal pH. At higher amendment rates (7.5 – 15 g ochre
269 kg^{-1} mass per dwt of soil), Depth 1-soils become acidic and would need lime
270 correction to maintain grass growth. Leonard et al. (2006) found that the mean C/N
271 ratio was 12.0 ± 1.8 , compared with 8.8 and 12.5 for Soils A and B, respectively (Table
272 1). Such results match the soil P status of the soils used in the current study i.e., low
273 fertilizer inputs and risk of P loss to surface water.

274

275 3.3 P_{Lost} and P_{Runoff}

276

277 All factors tested (Soil, ochre, P, ochre*P, ochre*Soil, Soil*P, and ochre*Soil*P) had
278 a significant influence on P_{Lost} , so no terms were removed from the predictive
279 statistical model (Table 2). For Soil (A, B) Depth (1, 2), the regressions of P_{Lost}
280 against ochre amendment are displayed in Figures 2 and 3. The slopes and intercepts
281 of the predicted lines using the P_{Lost} equation differed depending on the amount of
282 P_{Input} . Statistically, differences in background soil pH before any ochre amendment
283 explains variation in P_{Lost} between soils. Predicted lines occurred at an average pH for

284 that soil and ochre interaction. Actual and predicted results showed good agreement,
285 which allowed prediction of DRP in solution for given P inputs and ochre amounts on
286 these soils.

287

288 The P index of the soils ranged from 1 to 3. Soils in Index 1 and 2 are P deficient,
289 while in Index 3 are at target index, with a low risk of loss to water. This indicates P
290 concentrations from these soils in runoff will not affect maximum admissible
291 concentrations i.e. 0.035 mg DRP L⁻¹ due to dilution in the surface water body.
292 Phosphorus losses from Index 2-3 soils can still be quite high; for example, Kurz et al.
293 (2005) found DRP in runoff ranged from <0.005 to 0.19 mg L⁻¹ before fertilization
294 and 1.38 mg L⁻¹ after fertilization on grassland soils. For soils with no ochre or P
295 amendment, the P_{Runoff} concentrations were within this range (Table 3). Any P
296 addition increased P_{Runoff}, but ochre amendment (≥ 1.5 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil) was
297 successful in decreasing DRP losses. There was no significant difference between 0
298 and 0.15 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil results. Ochre amendment to soil without any P inputs
299 substantially decreased DRP losses. A rate of 30 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil was needed to
300 decrease DRP concentrations to acceptable levels for P inputs of ≤ 10 mg L⁻¹, which
301 represents the vast majority of cases in grassland runoff experiments.

302

303 3.4 Metal mobilisation during batch experiments

304

305 The ochre had the following metal content: Al, 4.8 ± 0.0 g kg⁻¹; Cu 0.3 ± 0.0 g kg⁻¹,
306 Fe, 246 ± 0.0 g kg⁻¹; Mg, 0.5 ± 0.0 g kg⁻¹; arsenic (As), 162 ± 18.3 mg kg⁻¹; Cd, 3.2 ± 0.3
307 mg kg⁻¹; Cr, 3.1 ± 1.8 mg kg⁻¹; Pb, 2087 ± 75.3 mg kg⁻¹; nickel (Ni), 1.7 ± 0.9 mg kg⁻¹;
308 and Zn, 250 ± 19.8 mg kg⁻¹. In the present study, the ratio of ochre to solution was

309 1:20. Average mobilisation of metals into solution after 24 h for distilled water
310 amended with ochre was: Cu, $14,044 \pm 290 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$; Fe, $1892 \pm 109 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$; K, 123 ± 1.6
311 mg L^{-1} ; Mg, $1.78 \pm 0.2 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$; Mn, $323 \pm 30.4 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$; Na, $2.9 \pm 0.2 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$; and Zn,
312 $18034 \pm 795 \mu\text{g L}^{-1}$. The pH of ochre in distilled water was 3, thereby allowing for
313 greater metal release. The soil and ochre combinations reduced much of the metal
314 mobilisation, but not enough in some cases to prevent recommended limits (Table 4a
315 and 4b). The control soils without ochre amendment had, in some cases, metal
316 concentrations above allowable limits. Soil A had high Cd, Cr, Fe, Ni and Pb
317 concentrations and Soil B had high Cd, Pb and Zn concentrations.

318

319 Kinetic tests indicated that most of the metal mobilization occurred within 1 min of
320 mixing P solutions with the ochre (Table 5). For all metals, high concentrations were
321 released in the first minute, decreased, and rose again after 1 hr. For P adsorption to
322 ochre, the opposite occurred, which involved rapid ligand exchange with surface
323 hydroxide groups at reactive sites and the formation of binuclear bridging complex
324 between a phosphate group and two Fe surface atoms, followed by a weaker ligand
325 exchange.

326

327 There has been some documentation of hazardous release of metals from coal mining
328 ochre in 5 out of 49 mine-water treatment facilities in the U.K. (Hancock 2005). The
329 ochre used in this study released toxic concentrations of metals in runoff. Inductively
330 coupled plasma mass spectrometry and bulk energy dispersive spectroscopy showed
331 potentially toxic concentrations of Fe, Zn, Pb, As and Cu (Fenton et al. 2009b).
332 Remobilisation of heavy metals might occur due to any reduction of iron oxides in the
333 soil and ochre, for example, by rising groundwater depths in a perched watertable

334 scenario e.g. glaciated tills or by incorporation into the buffer. International studies by
335 Winner et al (1980), Clements et al (1992) and Beltman et al (1999), have all shown
336 that discharge from AMD has negative effects on aquatic communities. These effects
337 include a reduction in species diversity and abundance, and a change in the
338 community structure from sensitive species such as Stonefly Larva to more tolerant
339 groups such as Tubificid worms. A study by Curran (2001) on the Avoca catchment,
340 found that there was a major decrease in aquatic invertebrate diversity and abundance
341 downstream from the Deep Adit discharge site (Figure 1). It was concluded that the
342 inflow adit ditch stream was uninhabitable for macro fauna because of its elevated
343 conductivity, acidic pH and high levels of metals and sulphates. Although these
344 concentrations will, to some extent, also be diluted by the main surface waterbody,
345 any release of toxic metal makes Avoca ochre unsuitable for use in buffer strips.

346

347 However, the methodology developed within this paper may be used to test the
348 effectiveness and feasibility of other amendments.

349

350 **4 Conclusions**

351 The findings of this grassland study are:

352 1. A proportional equation, which incorporated P sources and losses, was developed.

353 Back calculation identified optimal rates of ochre amendment to soil to ameliorate a

354 particular DRP concentration in runoff. A rate of 30 g ochre kg⁻¹ soil was needed to

355 decrease DRP concentrations to acceptable levels for P inputs of $\leq 10 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$.

356 2. Very quick and sustained metal release from the ochre tested during P sequestration

357 makes it unsuitable for use as a soil amendment to control P release to a waterbody.

358 However, the methodology developed in this study allows the optimal rate of addition

359 of any P sorbing amendment, when mixed with soil, to reduce the DRP below a
360 certain threshold value, to be determined.

361

362 **Acknowledgements** The authors would like to thank Denis Brennan, Maria Radford,
363 Deirdre Cullen and Con Dowdall for laboratory and field assistance.

364

365 **References**

366 Abu-Zreig, M., Rudra, R.P., Whiteley, H.R., Lalonde, M.N., & Kaushik, N.K. (2003).
367 Phosphorus removal in vegetated filter strips. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 32,
368 613-619.

369

370 Beltman, D.J., Clements, W.H., Lipton, J., & Cacela, D. (1999) Benthic invertebrate
371 metals exposure, accumulation, and community-level effects downstream from a
372 hard-rock mine site. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry*, 18, 2999-307.

373

374 Brennan, R. B., O. Fenton, Rodgers, M., & Healy, M. 2011. Evaluation of chemical
375 amendments to control phosphorus losses from dairy slurry. *Soil Use and*
376 *Management*,27(2), 238-246.

377

378 BSI..(1989). BS 1796: *Method of test for soils for civil*
379 *engineering purposes*. BS 1796. London: British Standards Institution.

380

381 Bozika, E. (2001). Phosphorus removal from wastewater using sludge from mine
382 drainage treatment settling ponds. University of Edinburgh. Unpublished MSc thesis.

383

384 Clements, W. H., Cherry, D.S., & Van Hassel, J.H. (1992) Assessment of the impact
385 of heavy metals on benthic communities at the Clinch River (Virginia): Evaluation of
386 an index of community sensitivity. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic
387 Science*, 49, 1686-1694.

388

389 Council of the European Union. (2009). European Communities environmental
390 objective (surface waters) regulations. S.I. No. 272 of 2009.

391

392 Cucarella, V. & Renman, G. (2009). Phosphorus sorption capacity of filter materials
393 used for on-site wastewater treatment determined in batch experiments-a comparative
394 study. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 38, 381-92.

395

396 Curran, F. (2001) Ecological and ecotoxicological investigation of ongoing discharge
397 of acid mine drainage (AMD) from the abandoned Avoca copper mines, Co.

398 Wicklow. PhD Thesis, University College Dublin.

399

400 Dobbie, K.E., Heal, K.V., Aumonier, J., Smith, K.A., Johnston, A., & Younger, P.L.
401 (2009). Evaluation of iron ochre from mine drainage treatment for removal of
402 phosphorus from wastewater. *Chemosphere*, 75, 795-800.

403

404 Dorioz, J.M., Wang, D., Poulenard, J., & Trévisan, D. (2006). The effect of grass
405 buffer strips on phosphorus dynamics - a critical review and synthesis as a basis for
406 application in agricultural landscapes in France. *Agriculture Ecosystems Environment*,
407 117, 4-21.

408

409 European Community. 2005. "Agri-environment Measures." European
410 Commission/Directorate General for Agriculture and Rural Development.
411

412 Elliott, H. A., O'Connor, G.A., Lu, P., & Brinton, S. 2002. Influence of Water
413 Treatment Residuals on Phosphorus Solubility and Leaching. *Journal of*
414 *Environmental Quality*, 31, 1362-1369.
415

416 Fenton, O., Healy, M.G., & Rodgers, M. (2007). Assessing the performance of
417 phosphorus retention using an Avoca – Avonmore catchment, ochre, Ireland in: IAH
418 (Ed.) Securing Groundwater Quality in Urban and Industrial Environments (Proc. 6th
419 International Groundwater Quality Conference). IAH, Fremantle, Western Australia.
420

421 Fenton, O., Healy, M.G., & Rodgers, M. (2009a). Use of ochre from an abandoned
422 metal mine in the South East of Ireland for phosphorus sequestration from dairy dirty
423 water. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 38, 1120-5.
424

425 Fenton, O., Healy, M.G., Rodgers, M., & ÓhUallacháin, D. (2009b). Site-specific P
426 absorbency of ochre from acid mine drainage near an abandoned Cu-S mine in the
427 Avoca-Avonmore catchment, Ireland. *Clay Minerals*, 44, 113-123.
428

429 Fenton, O., Serrenho, A., & Healy, M.G. (2011). Evaluation of Amendments to
430 Control Phosphorus Losses in Runoff from Dairy-Soiled Water. *Water, Air, & Soil*
431 *Pollution*: 1-10. DOI 10.1007/s11270-011-0815-8
432

433 Gallimore, L.E., Basta, N.T., Storm, D.E., Payton, M.E., Huhnke, R.H., & Smolen,
434 M.D. 1999. Water treatment residual to reduce nutrients in surface runoff from
435 agricultural land. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 28, 1474-1478.
436

437 Hancock, S. (2005). Quantifying ochre arisings: Output from the U.K. Coal
438 Authority's Mine Water Treatment sites. 9th International Mine Water Conference.
439

440 Heal, K.V., Younger, P.L., Smith, K.A., McHaffie, H., Batty, L.C. (2004). Removing
441 P From Sewage Effluent and Agricultural Runoff Using Ochre Recovered From Mine
442 Water Treatment. In: Valsami-Jones, E. (Ed.), *Phosphorus in Environmental*
443 *Technology: removal, recovery and applications*. IWA Publishing, London, pp. 320-
444 334.
445

446 Heal, K.V., Dobbie, K.E., Bozika, E., McHaffie, H., Simpson, A.E., & Smith, K.A.
447 (2005). Enhancing phosphorus removal in constructed wetlands with ochre from mine
448 drainage treatment. *Water Science Technology*, 51, 275-82.
449

450 Johansson-Westholm, L. (2006). Substrates for phosphorus removal-potential benefits
451 for on-site wastewater treatment? *Water Resources*, 40, 23-36.
452

453 Kurz, I., Tunney, H., & Coxon, C.E. (2005). The impact of agricultural management
454 practices on nutrient losses to water: data on the effects of soil drainage
455 characteristics. *Water Science Technology*, 51, 73-81.
456

457 Leonard, C., Mullen, G.J., Culleton, N., & Breen, J. (2006). Soil Properties and their
458 Influence on Grassland Production under Low Input and Organic Farming Conditions.
459 End of Project Report 4478, www.teagasc.ie
460

461 Moore, P.A., Jr., & Miller, D.M. (1994). Decreasing phosphorus solubility in poultry
462 litter with aluminium, calcium, and iron amendments. *Journal of Environmental*
463 *Quality*, 23, 325-330.
464

465 Penn, C., Bryant, R.B., Kleinman, P.J.A., & Allen, A.L. (2007). Removing Dissolved
466 Phosphorus From Drainage Ditch Water With Oxyhydroxides. 17th National Meeting
467 of the American Society for Surface Mining and Reclamation, Tampa, Florida.
468

469 Pratt, P.F., & Blair, F.L. (1963). Buffer method for estimating lime and sulphur
470 applications for pH control of soils. *Soil Science*, 93, 329-331.
471

472 Preedy, N., McTiernan, K., Matthews, R., Heathwaite, L., & Haygarth, P. (2001).
473 Rapid incidental phosphorus transfers from grassland. *Journal of Environmental*
474 *Quality*, 30, 2105-2112.
475

476 Rhoton, F.E., & Bigham, J.M. (2005). Phosphate adsorption by ferrihydrite-amended
477 soils. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 34, 890-896.
478

479 Schmitt, T.J., Dosskey, M.G., & Hoagland, K.D. (1999). Filter strip performance and
480 processes for different vegetation, widths, and contaminants. *Journal of*
481 *Environmental Quality*, 28, 1479-1489.

482

483 Sharpley, A.N., Daniel, T., Gibson, G., Bundy, L., Cabera, M., Sims, T., Stevens, R.,
484 Lemunyon, J., Kleinman, P., & Perry, R. (2006). Best Management Practices To
485 Minimise Agricultural Phosphorus Impacts On Water Quality. USDA-ARS,
486 Washington, DC.

487

488 Sibrell, P.L., Montgomery, G.A., Ritenour, K.L., & Tucker, T.W. (2009). Removal of
489 phosphorus from agricultural wastewaters using adsorption media prepared from acid
490 mine drainage sludge. *Water Research*, 43, 2240-2250.

491

492 Tunney, H., Sims, T., Foy, R.H., Luka, N., & Byrne, J.E. (1998). Comparison of five
493 extractants for available phosphorus in 100 Irish soils. (Abstract) *Irish Journal of*
494 *Agricultural & Food Research*, 37 (1), 110

495

496 Wagner, D.J., Elliott, H.A., Brandt, R.C., & Jaiswal, D. (2008). Managing Biosolids
497 Runoff phosphorus using buffer strips enhanced with drinking water treatment
498 residuals. *Journal of Environmental Quality*, 37, 1567-1574.

499

500 Winner, R.W., Boesel, M.W., & Farrell, M.P. (1980). Insect community structure as
501 an index of heavy metal pollution in lotic ecosystems. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries*
502 *and Aquatic Sciences*, 37, 647-655.

503

504 **Captions for Figures**

505 **Fig 1** Schematic of Avoca Avonmore catchment and sampling location.

506 **Fig 2** P_{Lost} (%) results and model predictions for both soils, soil depths for all ochre
507 amendments, and P concentrations (A-D). A high P_{Lost} (%) signifies a greater amount
508 of P in solution available to be lost to a waterbody and a low P_{Lost} (%) signifies more
509 P has been adsorbed by the ochre

510

511 **Fig 3** P_{Runoff} results and predictions for both soils, soil depths for all ochre
512 amendments, and P concentrations (A-D).

513

514

515

516

Table 1 Soil particle size distribution and organic fraction analysis for Soil A and B, Depth 1 and 2.

Soil (Depth)	Soil P Index	Coarse Sand	Fine Sand	Silt	Clay	C	N	C/N	P _m *	M3P**	Mg	K
			%			mg kg ⁻¹			mg kg ⁻¹			
Soil A (Depth 1)	3 (3.0-8.0 P _m -mg L ⁻¹)	43	25	30	2	2.1	0.2	8.8	5.5	36.2	206.2	102.8
Soil B (Depth 1)	1 (0.0-3.0 P _m -mg L ⁻¹)	26	14	45	15	0.2	-	-	2.6	19.1	202.7	122.1
Soil A (Depth 2)	1 (0.0-3.0 P _m -mg L ⁻¹)	40	30	17	13	1.5	1.2	12.5	2.8	20.4	256.9	199.8
Soil B (Depth 2)	1 (0.0-3.0 P _m -mg L ⁻¹)	48	28	6	18	0.7	-	-	2.7	19.8	212.1	132.0

517

*P_m- Morgan's P, **M3P - Mehlich 3 P

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

Table 2 Type 3 Tests of Fixed Effects

	Num - DF	Den - DF	F value	Pr > F
Soil	3	207	46.89	<.0001
Ochre	1	207	166.56	<.0001
P	3	207	474.90	<.0001
Ochre*P	3	207	25.36	<.0001
Ochre*Soil	3	207	17.47	<.0001
Soil*P	9	207	7.36	<.0001
Ochre*Soil*P	9	207	3.44	0.0006

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536 **Table 3** Predicted P_{Lost} (%) and P_{Runoff} (mg L^{-1}) with different P and ochre
 537 amendments.

Ochre amendment g ochre kg^{-1} soil	P amendment					P amendment				
	0	5	10	20	40	mg P L^{-1}				
	P_{Lost} (%)					P_{Runoff} (mg L^{-1})				
0	3	15	39	50	62	0.109	2.5	5.2	11.7	26.9
0.15	3.2	16	38	56	75	0.113	2.6	5.1	13.1	32.3
1.5	2.3	12	33	51	70	0.076	2.1	4.5	12.0	30.5
7.5	0.9	3	22	32	56	0.027	1.5	3.0	7.5	24.5
15	0.6	2	10	23	46	0.018	0.8	1.4	5.5	19.8
30	0	0	3	11	36	<DL	<DL	0.301	2.3	14.5

A high P_{Lost} (%) signifies a greater amount of P in solution available to be lost to a waterbody and a low P_{Lost} (%) signifies more P has been adsorbed by the ochre. Average P_{Runoff} after equilibrium with different P and ochre amendments. Both soils and soil depths included and all samples used (n=8).
 DL = detection limit

538

539

540

541

542 **Table 4 a.** Average mobilisation of metals (n=2) ± (standard deviation) into solution after 24 h. Soil A (Depth 1), all P concentrations and ochre

543 amendments

544

Ochre	P	pH	Ca	±**	Cd	±	Cr	±	Cu	±	Fe	±	K	±	Mg	±	Mn	±	Na	±	Ni	±	Pb	±	Zn	±
g kg ⁻¹	mg L ⁻¹		mg L ⁻¹		µg L ⁻¹																					
0	0	7.3	4.3	0.2	0.0	0.1	3.3	1.4	47.9	2.7	1500.1	478.0	4.1	0.3	1.5	0.1	2447.2	396.9	1.3	0.1	8.5	1.8	23.5	3.8	13.7	1.5
0	10	7.3	4.4	0.2	0.0	0.0	1.3	1.2	52.5	3.7	1055.4	703.2	10.5	0.2	1.5	0.1	2749.5	157.9	1.3	0.0	11.4	0.9	23.6	8.0	12.6	2.8
0	20	7.3	4.9	0.3	0.0	0.0	0.1	0.3	52.2	6.1	739.9	439.1	18.4	0.2	1.6	0.1	2972.2	209.9	1.3	0.1	10.1	2.2	25.8	5.6	12.6	4.7
0	40	7.3	5.2	0.5	0.0	0.0	1.7	3.3	46.5	15.2	486.5	508.9	36.4	1.1	1.6	0.2	2992.2	392.8	1.3	0.0	11.3	4.3	25.7	4.1	11.0	3.2
0.15	0	6.2	4.7	0.2	0.0	0.0	1.7	1.6	163.8	97.5	1495.0	1173.6	4.2	0.3	1.6	0.3	2900.0	458.0	1.3	0.0	10.1	1.5	36.6	7.9	17.6	4.1
0.15	10	6.2	4.6	0.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.2	79.7	3.4	594.9	465.8	10.8	0.0	1.5	0.0	2901.2	237.9	1.3	0.1	9.3	3.1	26.9	14.4	16.8	1.3
0.15	20	6.2	4.9	0.2	0.0	0.0	0.8	1.4	74.1	6.2	307.6	102.9	19.6	0.5	1.5	0.1	3126.8	200.7	1.3	0.1	6.4	4.0	32.9	10.8	13.3	1.2
0.15	40	6.2	6.0	0.4	0.0	0.0	0.5	0.1	81.8	12.6	405.6	101.9	37.1	0.5	1.9	0.1	3736.2	219.5	1.4	0.0	8.8	0.8	31.4	14.3	13.7	1.5
1.5	0	6.1	4.7	1.5	2.0	3.5	6.9	6.2	66.0	22.5	1966.2	2859.0	4.3	1.2	1.8	0.7	2828.9	898.9	1.3	0.4	15.1	8.6	18.3	18.1	21.1	13.2
1.5	20	6.1	5.9	0.5	1.0	1.4	7.1	4.6	85.7	9.4	1150.7	1497.5	11.7	0.6	1.9	0.3	3536.4	277.5	1.5	0.2	7.5	3.6	1.5	2.7	21.0	6.1
1.5	10	6.1	6.2	0.6	0.0	0.0	10.4	3.0	82.7	14.1	3010.4	1001.0	20.1	1.5	2.2	0.8	3770.1	394.6	1.4	0.1	12.5	7.2	5.1	5.0	24.7	15.7
1.5	40	6.1	6.7	0.7	0.0	0.0	4.8	1.4	71.1	12.5	277.5	19.0	37.7	1.5	2.0	0.2	3777.4	430.5	1.5	0.1	5.4	1.7	0.0	0.0	15.3	1.9
7.5	0	5.9	11.8	2.5	0.0	0.2	4.6	1.6	61.4	6.9	340.1	85.7	5.2	0.7	3.2	0.7	6713.2	1360.7	1.4	0.3	11.1	5.0	3.7	6.4	24.2	5.2
7.5	10	5.9	11.6	0.8	0.0	0.2	4.2	2.4	63.5	4.9	368.4	261.1	13.2	0.3	3.1	0.3	6545.3	463.8	1.4	0.1	8.8	5.7	0.0	0.0	27.6	1.0
7.5	20	5.9	11.6	0.6	0.1	0.2	9.1	6.8	76.3	14.6	2050.7	2989.2	22.2	1.1	3.3	0.5	6409.3	105.3	1.4	0.1	13.5	4.0	2.4	2.4	32.1	8.6
7.5	40	5.9	11.2	0.7	0.0	0.1	7.7	5.4	76.4	12.4	2301.0	3175.7	40.8	0.5	3.2	0.5	6201.6	399.6	1.3	0.1	14.9	5.7	4.8	8.3	31.7	9.8
15	0	5.7	17.0	1.1	0.0	0.0	3.6	1.3	76.5	13.2	739.2	356.0	5.8	0.1	4.2	0.2	10366.7	701.8	1.5	0.0	7.4	2.9	0.4	0.6	69.1	13.3
15	10	5.7	15.7	0.2	-0.1	0.1	6.0	1.8	97.9	4.8	655.5	284.0	13.6	1.2	3.9	0.0	9280.6	172.3	1.4	0.1	13.0	8.7	6.0	8.5	66.0	6.8
15	20	5.7	16.1	1.3	4.5	3.4	8.4	3.6	85.3	11.2	400.2	44.8	23.5	0.4	4.0	0.3	9604.4	726.7	1.5	0.2	13.0	5.6	11.9	10.5	72.8	5.2
15	40	5.7	16.0	0.5	0.7	0.3	5.2	5.5	95.0	41.2	1507.3	2105.7	50.8	6.7	4.0	0.5	9546.0	391.8	1.4	0.2	13.2	0.9	4.6	5.0	76.2	8.7
Limit*					0.2		0.6		5												20		7.2		40	

545 *Annual average environmental quality standards for surface waters (other than inland surface waters) (Council of the European Union, 2009) **± standard deviation

546 **Table 4 b.** Metal concentrations in solution after batch experiments (n=2) ± (standard deviation) with Soil B (Depth 1), all P concentrations and
 547 ochre amendments

Ochre	P	pH	Ca	±**	Cd	±	Cr	±	Cu	±	Fe	±	K	±	Mg	±	Mn	±	Na	±	Ni	±	Pb	±	Zn	±
g kg ⁻¹	mg L ⁻¹		mg L ⁻¹												µg L ⁻¹											
0	0	7.0	3.9	0.8	0.3	0.4	6.3	1.8	54.2	9.0	1518.7	707.6	3.4	0.5	1.8	0.4	573.3	181.9	1.4	0.0	4.0	1.1	12.0	6.9	28.8	8.9
0	10	7.0	2.2	0.6	0.1	0.1	5.7	1.0	58.2	5.6	965.0	90.7	9.7	0.4	1.5	0.2	527.6	81.4	1.4	0.2	2.4	1.6	0.0	0.2	32.5	4.9
0	20	7.0	2.8	0.2	0.0	0.2	7.5	1.0	61.4	2.8	1247.9	234.2	18.2	0.2	1.8	0.1	626.8	36.6	1.5	0.1	10.5	3.4	1.3	2.3	39.8	2.8
0	40	7.0	3.1	0.3	0.0	0.1	8.0	1.2	64.1	2.7	1201.7	245.1	41.3	1.1	1.8	0.0	621.8	48.0	1.7	0.3	7.4	2.2	2.6	3.9	39.5	4.3
0.15	0	5.9	3.6	0.7	0.4	0.7	4.9	1.8	37.6	7.5	1391.7	329.3	3.6	0.3	2.2	0.3	749.9	116.1	1.8	0.3	10.7	7.0	8.4	3.9	31.7	5.9
0.15	10	5.9	3.2	0.5	0.2	0.3	6.4	1.6	38.4	2.3	1352.8	147.1	11.1	0.4	2.0	0.1	722.0	74.9	1.7	0.1	8.6	1.9	9.1	15.8	35.1	1.7
0.15	20	5.9	3.7	1.1	0.0	0.1	14.2	2.5	52.5	10.5	2995.6	1450.3	20.6	0.6	2.5	0.5	797.9	194.4	1.9	0.2	12.3	6.5	13.0	9.9	46.4	12.7
0.15	40	5.9	4.5	0.6	3.5	6.0	9.6	4.2	53.8	15.4	1412.1	103.9	43.0	3.4	2.4	0.0	748.6	134.3	1.9	0.1	16.3	4.7	16.3	16.4	45.9	8.4
1.5	0	6.0	5.2	1.4	0.7	1.1	8.8	4.9	47.8	17.4	2098.5	1570.9	3.6	0.4	2.2	0.6	681.9	205.5	1.6	0.0	11.7	2.8	8.9	11.0	36.9	8.6
1.5	10	6.0	4.4	0.1	0.0	0.2	5.9	1.2	47.9	4.3	1481.6	105.7	9.9	0.1	1.7	0.0	596.1	12.0	1.6	0.1	9.9	4.1	17.4	16.6	39.1	2.8
1.5	20	6.0	4.5	0.2	0.0	0.2	3.7	0.4	53.5	2.5	1276.9	486.7	17.6	0.4	1.7	0.1	595.3	26.2	1.5	0.0	10.3	4.1	11.8	14.8	41.2	3.3
1.5	40	6.0	5.1	0.8	0.1	0.1	2.8	2.3	43.1	10.7	1017.3	269.9	39.0	1.9	1.9	0.2	632.7	92.6	1.8	0.3	4.8	5.2	7.9	6.1	39.5	5.4
7.5	0	5.7	9.3	1.0	0.0	0.1	1.3	1.0	61.4	6.4	1165.2	223.4	3.9	0.4	3.3	0.3	1187.2	91.1	1.6	0.1	8.3	1.7	6.5	11.3	53.8	8.6
7.5	10	5.7	7.7	2.2	0.0	0.2	1.4	1.0	63.4	11.4	1049.4	262.0	11.5	0.6	2.8	0.6	943.7	313.2	1.8	0.3	9.4	3.6	17.7	4.5	57.0	14.0
7.5	20	5.7	10.1	3.6	0.2	0.3	4.3	0.9	102.3	14.3	1234.5	66.8	20.3	0.9	3.5	1.2	1236.1	369.8	2.0	0.7	5.6	3.1	22.5	14.7	73.9	5.9
7.5	40	5.7	7.5	0.3	0.2	0.4	2.6	0.4	83.9	5.0	1055.1	256.2	40.8	0.3	2.7	0.1	935.8	33.1	1.6	0.0	9.0	6.0	8.7	11.4	64.9	2.8
15	0	5.6	23.6	2.5	0.0	0.3	8.3	12.5	9.8	9.8	5262.2	5987.8	2.7	1.9	1.6	1.4	128.5	95.8	0.5	0.1	7.6	9.3	7.6	13.2	20.4	14.3
15	10	5.6	27.0	1.7	3.5	3.9	16.0	7.1	22.9	7.1	6366.1	1747.4	12.4	1.0	2.1	0.5	80.0	33.3	0.6	0.1	3.8	4.4	24.8	19.5	23.0	9.8
15	20	5.6	30.7	0.5	0.6	0.2	4.3	1.5	9.7	3.4	1541.1	1320.5	22.7	1.1	1.0	0.3	23.3	12.2	0.5	0.0	2.2	3.8	20.4	7.0	5.4	2.4
15	40	5.6	35.7	0.4	0.3	0.5	1.8	1.7	4.2	1.4	1181.4	52.9	47.1	1.0	1.0	0.1	15.7	1.1	0.5	0.0	0.9	1.1	21.4	7.3	4.5	0.9
Limit*					0.2		0.6		5												20		7.2		40	

548 *Annual average environmental quality standards for surface waters (other than inland surface waters) (Council of the European Union, 2009) **± standard deviation

549

Table 5 Kinetic experiment. Metal concentration release over time \pm (standard deviation).

Minutes	Ca	\pm^*	Cu	\pm	Fe	\pm	K	\pm	Mg	\pm	Mn	\pm	Na	\pm	Zn	\pm
	mg L ⁻¹		$\mu\text{g L}^{-1}$													
1	8.4	0.0	8699	2761	1369	238	134.8	2.4	1.6	0.1	280.2	18.3	2.6	0.0	13045	1163
5	8.1	0.2	12570	121	1358	168	135.8	0.8	1.3	0.0	231.8	8.1	2.2	0.0	15905	308.
10	5.9	2.9	6570	8573	667	441	137.1	3.9	0.6	0.8	187.4	52.9	1.8	0.5	8218	10905
15	4.2	1.9	6180	2491	732	86.0	69.3	27.2	0.6	0.2	118.8	43.4	1.2	0.6	7421	2840
30	3.2	0.0	9014	345	817	28.6	62.5	3.2	0.5	0.0	105.7	8.6	0.8	0.0	10318	842
60	6.1	1.4	14918	4294	973	192.0	109.2	19.5	0.9	0.2	165.6	34.1	1.5	0.3	16564	4295

* \pm standard deviation

550





